

## Meeting Minutes

Recording:

[https://drive.google.com/file/d/18XWHLHrXOnNz14LD1D6v\\_X5jKekzUMkob/view?usp=sharing](https://drive.google.com/file/d/18XWHLHrXOnNz14LD1D6v_X5jKekzUMkob/view?usp=sharing)

Town of Hartford Committee on Racial Equity and Inclusion

Wednesday July 1, 2020

6:00 PM to 7:30 PM

Time	Agenda Topic	Committee Action
6:00 PM	Call to Order/Welcome Consent Agenda In Attendance: Allene Swienckowski, John Hall, Ann Raynolds, Giavanna Munfa, Joe Major, Alicia Barrow, Michelle Boleski Community Members: Brannon Godfrey, Hartford Town Manager Pat Autillio, Bradford Houlk, Kim Souza, Marva Williams- Lowe Special Guests for Presentation: Chief Phillip Kasten, Karen Gennette, Robin Jay Approve June 17, 2020 Minutes (Minutes emailed 06/22) Tabled until after presentation	
6:05 PM.	Acknowledge Community Members Community Members Input	
6:15 PM	Chief Kasten – Analysis of Traffic Stops by Hartford Police via Robin Joy, JD, PhD Director of Research, Crime Research Group, Montpelier Karen Gennette, Executive Director, Crime Research Group, Montpelier Question and Answer Session to follow presentation.	

Race/Traffic Stops Part of UVM study that began because of FIPP. Work of collecting and analyzing data was funded by Federal and local grants.

Karen Gennette – Stated info gathered over twenty years of court data.

[https://public.tableau.com/profile/robin.adler.weber#!/vizhome/Hartford\\_15830774356740/Story1?publish=yes](https://public.tableau.com/profile/robin.adler.weber#!/vizhome/Hartford_15830774356740/Story1?publish=yes)

Accumulated data required 'cleaning' because some data was duplicated in studies original form. Hartford has relatively accurate data. Part of the study focused on capturing multiple stops with same individual for same violation. Multiple citations for same problem can be prohibitively expensive. Chief Kasten stated that he and his staff are exploring ways to assist multiple traffic offenders that cannot afford to pay increasing fines, hence the necessity to capture multiple stops for the exact same violations. The question of course is, are more violations/warnings being given to POC? This information is difficult to glean from traffic stops, especially in Hartford based on nearby freeway exit and on-ramps from the 89 and 91, and the traffic generated by non-Hartford residents. Reviewed data from 2016 thru 2019.

---

Robin Joy, JD, PhD

presented on findings from Race/Traffic Stop data for HPD as part of her work with the UVM study.

Website -

[https://public.tableau.com/profile/robin.adler.weber#!/vizhome/Hartford\\_15830774356740/Story1?publish=yes](https://public.tableau.com/profile/robin.adler.weber#!/vizhome/Hartford_15830774356740/Story1?publish=yes)

### Summary:

The town of Hartford has relatively accurate data but the compiled data also required a lot of manual cleaning to eliminate duplication of single traffic stops that had been entered twice by two different staff members at HPD. The data also captured multiple warnings given to residents.

Much of the data collection issues will be automatically normalized with the upcoming use of the ECitation system being adopted in 2020

Hartford's numbers of stops per year are consistent across all three years.

DATA : Dates reviewed 2016-2019

- the DUI data appears to be low. If the stop results in arrest, no ticket is issued.
- There data shows that there are missing outcomes, and those outcomes are currently being worked on by HPD dept staff.

- HPD collects residence data in order to determine whether stops are for Hartford residents or just from people passing through the town of Hartford.
- Census data in relation to resident population is challenging in Vermont. The margin of error is very high, and police stop data reflects people from all 50 states and Canada
- Multiple stops/tickets for the same issues – (Chief Kasten recommended residents carry the original violation in their glove compartment to show if being stopped for the same violation). Multiple violations for the same issue, like a broken taillight, can cause financial burden and general frustration for citizens. HPD is looking to create a monthly report to track patterns and establish data collection to identify these types of traffic stops.
- There is not a lot of variance in Light versus Dark skinned individuals (It is difficult for an officer to determine the race of a person, especially at night, until the officer physically approaches the vehicle and can clearly see inside the vehicle) data when attempting to determine for racial bias of officer in traffic stops. The theory is more an officer, if racially biased, is more likely to pull over a POC during daylight hours when they can see into the vehicle.
- This methodology is not a good determinant in Vermont – Day light covers many shifts in summer and possibly only reflects one officer shift in winter hours. This method does not capture the culture of HPD officers and its culture.
- Collected data is hard to reconcile with experiential stories from individuals about their traffic stops
- There appears to be very little if any data of stops that result in searches by HPD, therefore there are no patterns of discernible bias in search data in Hartford.
- Data entry by multiple clerks for the same violation also leads to search challenges - one event could end up being entered by two different staff members and because of data entry errors, one violation could have two different locations: example: a stop at State and Main vs Main and State) This specific challenge should be solved by eCitation
- Using Crash data to benchmark problems in Hartford was found to be inconclusive

### Conclusions:

Benchmarking a driving population does not work for HPD  
Census data has a large margin of error, crash data fluctuates  
Search and hit rates are informative but are tainted by systemic racism

### Recommendations:

If possible, standardize data entry. If an entry has been made, a prompt in the system should alert a second data entry clerk that citation has already been logged.

Create a monthly report to identify repeat drivers stopped to determine if these same stops are all necessary

### Questions:

Giavanna M. -Can you expand on your comment on systemic racism in searches?

There is an assumption that if carrying contraband a person will act in a rational manner not to get searched - what's rational varies from person/person?

There is also the concern of does a person have the access to commit a certain type of crime - to embezzle you have to have access to finances as example.

The types of crimes a subset is being pulled over for varies by race

John H - Can we find the Stop Address data on a map?

Right now it does not include Latitude/Longitude.

Chief - ECitation should log that data

John H-what are the circumstances that lead to two different people entering data for the same stop?

Chief: The officer doesn't enter the data at the time the citation is issued, nor does the officer enter the citation at the end of their shift. Citations are entered by communications specialists, at HPD eight different people do this work. Someone could be stopped and receive a non-moving violation as well as a warning, in theory, two citations. The data entered should reflect only the data on the first citation, the second citation, entered in the system should appear without any data, but if data is entered by a second specialist will create disparities in the data.

John H- What's the process for validating conflicting data (i.e., contraband found versus no contraband found)?

Chief: Half of the data for 2020 will be comprised of fifty percent manual and fifty percent eCitations for 2020 data. HPD has been consistent about putting in the data this year.

Alicia B - is every stop documented?

Chief: Yes. Every stop requires an officer to document the stop and provide initial information about the stop whether a citation is issued or not. Initial data had many people counted multiple times because stops to tickets ratio is not 1 to 1.

Robin J: I sent a lot of stop patterns to the Chief. I found, searching the data, that the same person was stopped repeatedly. Conclusion? The report finds these patterns before they become patterns.

Joe M: If there are equipment issues and a citation issued, are drivers given a certain amount of time to cure/fix the infraction?

Chief: Yes. Use the first equipment violation ticket to attempt to avoid subsequent violations. Subsequent violations are warnings.

Marva L: Can Robyn clarify the census data she has for White River? Did you say there are 24 African Americans in your data?

Robin J: I will send a link that targets the Margin of Error on the census data. In trying to get data to tell the story versus benchmarking that allows the data to show its fine. Most states/towns stopped using census data for comparing drivers.

Sara C: Did you look at data from Upper Valley towns in addition to Hartford, since we are so interconnected?

Robin J: We can dig into that data, if those respective towns want to pay for said data collection and study. Commuting data is difficult to interpret.

John H: That kind of data is really interesting in an area like the Upper Valley. How

do we look at those areas?

Robin J: It's difficult because of state lines, especially. I could find out if there are college research projects that could look at that data

Chief: Closing remarks:

Glad to have the chance to look at the data, to acknowledge that our area has different demographics that are more rural in some areas than others in the town. We, HPD, really are concerned with disparate treatment of people. We will remain vigilant in making sure that is not happening and I always open to returning and answering your questions and addressing your concerns.

---

TABLED      Hartford School District Policy on Racism - put on next agenda  
Collaboration with UN Law School's Schweitzer Scholars - Jameson Davis and Arielle King

Review of draft documents – amendments made at 6/24 School Board meeting. Will have final vote at July meeting.

Thank you to Arielle and Jameson for their hard work on this

<https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#search/press+release?projector=1>- Policy draft

<https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#search/press+release?projector=1> Press Release

---

TABLED      From the office of Rep. Kevin Christie – Social Equity Caucus –  
Discussion of Use of Force and VT legislative changes

---

7:15 PM      Motion by Sara and Seconded by John to Approve Meeting Minutes For 06/17/20. Motion passed unanimously.

---

7:17 PM.      Proposed Dates and Times for Retreat

A Motion by John:

was made to form a sub-committee composed of Allene, Sara, Ann, and Giovanna to coordinate a personal development retreat closed to

the public session. A further check with Secretary of State on Open Meeting Law relative to a Personal Development Retreat without warning by HCOEI. (Ann is checking her state source again) Structure of retreat must also consider the constraints of conducting the retreat via Zoom and the effects of Zoom fatigue especially after two hours.

Doodle poll will determine date for retreat. Giovanna seconded.

The Motion passed.

Note: This is not the same as the motion passed last meeting – HCOEI will still hold a special meeting to focus on the Strategic Plan.

---

Congratulations:

to Alicia Barrow and Joe Major for their extraordinary work arranging Hartford's first Juneteenth Celebration. The celebration was arranged post haste. Joe emphasized it was Alicia's hard work and diligence that pulled the celebration all together.

---

7:46 PM

Adjournment